

**DRAFT MINUTES OF THE  
MAG REGIONAL AVIATION SYSTEM PLAN POLICY COMMITTEE**

Maricopa Association of Governments (MAG) Office  
302 North 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue, Ste. 200, Saguaro Room  
Phoenix, Arizona

November 18, 2003

**MEMBERS IN ATTENDANCE**

Mayor Elaine Scruggs, Chair, Glendale  
Mayor Vincent Francia, Cave Creek  
\*Councilmember Bob Caccamo, Chandler  
Councilmember Dave Crozier, Gilbert  
Councilmember Ken Porter  
Mayor Keno Hawker, Mesa  
Councilmember Robert Littlefield, Scottsdale  
\*Councilmember Thomas Allen, Surprise  
Vice Mayor Barb Carter for Mayor Neil  
Giuliano, Tempe

Councilmember David Lane, Wickenburg  
\*Supervisor Fulton Brock, Maricopa County  
Councilmember Claude Mattox, City of  
Phoenix  
Ray Boucher, Arizona Department of  
Transportation  
Richard Dykas, Federal Aviation  
Administration  
\*Lt. Colonel Kris Greene, Arizona Air National  
Guard  
Colonel Peter Costello, Luke AFB

**OTHERS IN ATTENDANCE**

Greg Chenoweth, Chandler  
Brian Townsend, Gilbert  
Wayne Balmer, Mesa  
Mark Meyers, Mesa  
Kelly McMullen, McDOT  
Steve Grubbs, Phoenix  
Christopher Hacker, Phoenix  
David Krietor, Phoenix  
Debbie Klein, Phoenix  
Marsha Wallace, Phoenix  
Sharon Wood, Phoenix  
Scott Gray, Scottsdale  
Jennifer Lewis, Scottsdale  
Miryam Gutier, Glendale  
Steve Methvin, Glendale

Mark Ripley, Glendale  
Oddvar Tveit, Tempe  
Amber Wakeman, Tempe  
Pam Keidel, Wilbur Smith  
Scott LeCount, Wilbur Smith  
Lynn Kusy, Williams Gateway Airport  
Rusty Gant, State Transportation Board  
Evelyn Hallman, Citizen  
Barbara Sherman, Citizen  
Millie Swick, Citizen  
Amy Duffy, Consultant  
George Sullivan, Consultant  
Randal Weidemann, Consultant  
Gerald Pennington, Federal Aviation  
Administration  
Tom Remes, MAG  
Harry Wolfe, MAG

1. **Call to Order**

The meeting was called to order at 11:20 a.m. by Chairman Elaine Scruggs.

2. Review of Minutes of December 10, 2002

Chairman Elaine Scruggs asked if there were any comments on the minutes. Harry Wolfe noted that he had misspelled the name of the Luke Air Force Base (AFB) representative at the meeting; and that it should have been spelled Colonel "Dennis Rea."

It was moved by Vice Mayor Barbara Carter of Tempe, seconded by Councilmember Ken Porter of Goodyear and unanimously recommended to approve the meeting minutes as amended.

3. Overview and Status Report on the MAG RASP Update

Harry Wolfe provided a brief overview and status report on the MAG RASP Update. He provided an explanation of the objectives and perspective of a regional system plan, noting it focused on major projects that have significant region-wide impacts. He also emphasized that while the RASP sought to accommodate future demand for air transportation services, one of its basic assumptions was that proposed development should not impair the mission of Luke AFB.

Mayor Scruggs asked Harry Wolfe to identify the criteria that were used to evaluate the alternatives in the MAG RASP. Mr. Wolfe responded that the criteria included noise, air quality, airspace, impact on mission of Luke AFB, delay, cost, and user convenience.

Mayor Scruggs said it was her recollection that some time ago, the Technical Committee had been given a stronger role in the review of the RASP. Harry Wolfe responded that although the Technical Committee had been disbanded as a part of the MAG committee streamlining process in 1997, that he continued to meet with technical staff to solicit input. He concurred with Mayor Scruggs' reference to the increased role of technical staff in the process. He noted that after the forecast report was prepared, the Policy Committee sent it back to technical staff for review. He explained that subsequently, each working paper was sent to the technical staff for review, and then their comments were sent to the MAG RASP Policy Committee for consideration.

4. Review of Working Paper #5, Evaluation of Alternatives

Pam Keidel of Wilbur Smith gave a presentation on the evaluation of Working Paper #5 explaining the process that was used in evaluating the alternatives.

Colonel Peter Costello asked if the evaluation criteria were weighted. Mayor Keno Hawker said that it was difficult to weight the evaluation factors. He said that he liked the broad brush approach. Vice Mayor Carter said she agreed with Mayor Hawker's comments. She added that she was concerned about looking at each airport separately, since there is only so much airspace in the region.

Councilmember Robert Littlefield provided the perspective of someone who was heavily involved in airport environmental issues. He said that some issues do not lend themselves to weighting factors and

some issues are political in nature.

Mayor Scruggs pointed out: the omission of reference to Luke Auxiliary Field #1 and Gila Bend Auxiliary Field from the report; and the omission of Luke traffic patterns.

Pam Keidel responded that the two fields had not been referenced in earlier reports and that no comments had been received from Luke AFB. She said that she would be willing to add the airports to the Working Paper and understood that the facilities are part of the Luke AFB system. Ms. Keidel added that the Luke AFB traffic patterns had not been included in the report because they had not been provided. However, she noted that the traffic patterns would be added.

Pam Keidel added that the airspace analysis had been forwarded to Luke AFB staff prior to it being released as a part of the Working Paper; but that few comments were provided at that time.

Mayor Hawker asked if Luke AFB F-16's fly with live ordnance? Colonel Costello said that they do fly with live ordnance.

Mayor Hawker asked if the F-16's fly over residential areas while carrying the live ordnance? Colonel Costello said that F-16s do not fly over residential areas with live ordnance. He said that flight paths had been modified to avoid residential areas.

Mayor Keno asked how development that is occurring on the West side is impacting Luke AFB. Colonel Costello responded that there are committees working with Luke AFB on a southern departure corridor.

Terry Hansen said that in examining airspace, you need to look beyond the region. He pointed out that what happens throughout the state as well as with Los Angeles and Albuquerque centers impacts airspace in the region. He also emphasized the importance of the Jackal/Outlaw MOAs and preserving them for use by Luke AFB.

Pam Keidel indicated that there were some issues that had been raised that were outside the scope of the consultant's contract. She said that she could respond to the comments raised that were within the scope.

Vice Mayor Carter asked to look at Exhibit 5.1 on page 5-10 related to a fourth runway at Phoenix-SkyHarbor. She stated that she did not think that an alternative with this project had been approved. Pam Keidel pointed out that the projects included in the alternatives were included in Working Paper #4, Alternatives, which was approved at the December 10, 2002 MAG RASP Policy Committee meeting.

Vice Mayor Carter also stated that she objected to using a single page to respond to all the comments that had been offered on the RASP. Pam Keidel pointed out that many of the comments did not require that the consultant take any action. She said the purpose of the summary was to identify the major items that they would be pursuing as a result of the comments.

Councilmember Littlefield stated that there are some issues that the RASP may not have taken into

account, but that these might be outside the scope of the effort. He said that the RASP does not take into account some externalities. He said that the charter of the MAG RASP Policy Committee was to look at solutions for meeting future capacity needs.

Councilmember Littlefield stated that noise goes beyond the noise contours. He indicated that in Scottsdale, most of the complaints come from people who live far outside the noise contours.

Mayor Vincent Francia said that he sympathized with Councilmember Littlefield's plight.

Dick Dykas of the FAA pointed out that millions of dollars and years will be spent on doing a detailed airspace analysis in the Los Angeles area, but the study would not come up with any magic solutions to the airspace challenges confronting us.

Mr. Dykas said that while the MAG RASP Update will influence the future airport system, projects would be subjected to greater scrutiny and more detailed analysis when they were ready to be formally considered.

Pam Keidel pointed out that no study can tell you the capacity of a volume of airspace. It can provide insight on potential delay, but not a specific number of airplanes that can be handled.

Dick Dykas said that he agreed with Ms. Keidel's comments.

Chairman Scruggs noted that the RASP budget had been increased by an additional \$77,000 to consider the airspace impacts of projects on Luke AFB, but that there was still a lot of airspace work that needed to be done.

Pam Keidel explained that Wilbur Smith had used those funds to conduct an analysis of the airspace impact of each project in the RASP on Luke AFB and on Sky Harbor. She said that it did not, however, cover performing detailed modeling which was beyond the scope of the study. She said that such analysis could be conducted, once a potential future scenario was identified. Ms. Keidel said that the future scenario would likely be a hybrid of the alternatives evaluated.

Mayor Vincent Francia said that growth in the region is a political reality pointing out that there would be another three million people here in the next 20 years.

Councilmember Littlefield said that you can't expect the FAA to make commitments on projects in advance of their submission to the FAA for funding approval.

Vice Mayor Barbara Carter said that she was concerned that lengthy staff comments had been watered down in the response. She said that she would like to see technical staff get back together and bring back a recommendation. She said the report was too indepth to fully comprehend its implications.

Mayor Hawker urged the committee to move the effort forward. He said that nothing would be gained through delay. It was moved by Mayor Hawker, and seconded by Claude Mattox to direct the consultant to use the evaluation conducted in Working Paper #5 and proceed with developing a recommended

future scenario in Working Paper #6; to defer the scheduled December 4, 2003 public meeting until after the future scenario was developed; and to have the Technical staff take a stronger role in reviewing and providing a recommendation on Working Paper #6 to the Policy Committee before the Committee meets again. The motion carried unanimously with two abstentions.

Chairman Scruggs indicated that she had to leave the meeting for another appointment and asked Mayor Hawker to assume responsibility as the Acting Chairman.

5. MAG RASP Public Meeting

Harry Wolfe reported that based on the motion passed, the December 4, 2003 MAG RASP Public Meeting - would be cancelled and rescheduled sometime after the consultant has developed its recommendation of a scenario.

6. Efforts to Protect and Preserve the Mission of Luke AFB

Colonel Peter Costello reported on MILCON appropriations. These are federal funds that were provided last year and again this year to assist in efforts to acquire land to support the mission of Luke AFB. Specifically, last year's allocation was to acquire land around the Munitions Storage Area (MSA) and the residual to be applied to the Southern Departure Corridor. Currently, the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers is evaluating the Luke AFB mission requirement and land appraisal.

Harry Wolfe reported that the Arizona Department of Commerce is pursuing a study that contains numerous policy recommendations for achieving compatibility between Luke AFB and the Base. He also mentioned that a military committee was working on initiatives to help Luke, and that individual local jurisdictions were pursuing actions to achieve compatibility with Base operations. Colonel Costello also noted that the Department of Commerce is working on a land use study around Luke Auxiliary Field #1 and another study around the Gila Bend Auxiliary Field. He said it was important to protect the viability of both Luke Auxiliary Field #1 and of the Gila Bend Auxiliary Field. Harry Wolfe asked if there were some kind of understanding with the Town of Gila Bend regarding the preservation of the Gila Bend Auxiliary Range. Colonel Costello said that the Base and Gila Bend had entered into an agreement containing language which was designed to protect Luke AFB.

7. Report on Other Aviation Matters that Have an Impact on the Region

Harry Wolfe noted that the FAA would probably be pursuing some airspace initiatives in the future, like Northwest 2000. He asked Gerald Pennington, the FAA official from the Phoenix Terminal Radar Approach Control (TRACON), for an update.

Mr. Pennington stated that there were no firm plans at this time to initiate an airspace restructuring plan in the south part of the region, but that the FAA is always examining ways to enhance the efficiency of the airspace system. He noted that the Air Traffic Controls Union is pushing for consolidation of Terminal Radar Approach Controls in Arizona in a manner similar to what has been done in Southern California. Mr. Pennington commended Randall Wiedeman, the MAG RASP airspace consultant, for doing an excellent job in analyzing the airspace situation in the region. He mentioned that Mr.

Wiedemann had spent many hours analyzing the airspace interactions among airports and meeting with airspace officials.

8. Call to the Audience

There were no requests from the audience to speak. However, prior to the close of the meeting, Councilmember David Lane indicated that the town had planned a new airport in the next 25 years and that the current airport will not serve all of the town's needs.

The meeting adjourned at 1:10 p.m.